

Our Reference No. 2223-171

**IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

Confirmation No.: 5362

Appl. No. : 10/731,741  
Applicants : Schmitt et al.  
Filed : December 10, 2003  
Title : Cell Preparations Comprising Cells of the T Cell Lineage  
and Methods of Making and Using Same.  
TC./A.U. : 1632  
Examiner : Anoop Kumar Singh  
  
Docket No. : 2223-171  
Customer No. : 001059

**DECLARATION UNDER 37 C.F.R. 1.132**

Honourable Commissioner for Patents  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450

Dear Sir:

I, Ellen Rothenberg citizen of the United States of America and resident of California declare that the following facts are within my knowledge and are true.

1. I am a Professor of Biology at the California Institute of Technology. My research studies the molecular mechanisms that are responsible for developmental lineage choice as hematopoietic stem cells differentiate into T

lymphocytes. My laboratory focusses on identifying the transcription factors and signaling events that induce T-lineage gene expression in an uncommitted precursor and determining how they work to force the cell to relinquish other developmental options. My curriculum vitae is attached as Exhibit A.

2. I have reviewed the above-referenced application (hereinafter "the application") and the Office Action for the application that issued on October 27, 2008.

3. In particular, I note the Examiner's objection the claims as being obvious over a combination of the references Jaleco et al. (2001, J. Exp. Med. 194:991-1001, IDS); Nakano et al. (1994, Science 265:5157 IDS); Pui et al. (Immunity, 1999, 11(3):299-308), and Tatsumi et al. (1990, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. 87:2750-2754, IDS). I respectfully disagree with the Examiner for the reasons that follow.

4. For researchers working at the frontier of T-cell developmental biology in 2002, the publication by the inventors of the OP9-DL coculture method for T-cell generation in vitro was nothing short of a revolution. From the vantage point of hindsight in 2009, this impact may not be as clear as it was to everyone in the field at the time. The results of the inventors accomplished two completely novel things. One is that it decisively refuted the prevailing theory in the field, that T-cell development could only occur in a complex three-dimensional tissue (van

Ewijk et al., 1999- full citations in Appendix B). The other is that it provided for the first time a way to drive cells efficiently through successive stages of T-cell development through the full acquisition of cell-surface T-cell receptors under defined conditions. The effect of the work of the inventors was to transform the entire T-cell development field and to convert the T-cell development process from a difficult, irreproducible, laborious, and intractable problem to study into one of the most transparent and accessible of all mammalian developmental systems. The discontinuity was enormous.

5. The Examiner has adduced several papers that he believes weaken the case for the inventiveness of the OP9-DL coculture system. In particular, he points to the following, which were already known at the time: (1) the importance of Notch signaling for T-cell development and for suppression of B-cell development (Pui et al., 1999) [in fact, (Radtke et al., 1999) was also important to provide physiological relevance]; (2) the usefulness of the OP9 stromal cell line for eliciting B-cell development from embryonic stem cells (Nakano et al., 1994); and (3) the fact that some cells with cytoplasmic CD3 (a T- and NK-lineage marker) could be grown out of human precursor cells at the expense of B-cell development when the cells were cocultured with a different stromal line expressing Delta family but not Jagged family Notch ligands (Jaleco et al., 2001). He points to prior knowledge that different stromal lines could support different outcomes and contend that it was obvious to use Delta family molecules

in OP9 cells to solve the problem of in vitro T-cell development in 2002. In fact, while these foundational studies are relevant in a scholarly way to the generation of the OP9-DL system, they did not anticipate its effects.

6. Critically affecting the debate at the time were other features of the systems, not remarked by the Examiner. Knowledge of these other features actively held back other researchers from anticipating the success that the inventors in fact went on to obtain.

First, Notch signaling was already known to be complex, and not simply an instructive signal to make T cells. Abnormal Notch activation could cause T-cell development in abnormal sites (Pui et al., 1999), the biochemical events in this case were known not to be equivalent to Notch activation by interaction with normal Notch ligands. For example, although abnormally activated forms of Notch were able to affect certain aspects of T-cell development (the CD4/CD8 lineage choice), it was already known that normal Notch1 was not required for this event (Wolfer et al., 2001; Deftos et al., 2000; Robey et al., 1996), thus casting doubt on the biological relevance of artificial Notch activation such as that used by Pui et al. Second, Notch was known to affect many hematopoietic cell developmental decisions (Lam et al., 2000; Shelly et al., 2000; Tan-Pertel et al., 2000; Ohishi et al., 2000; Milner and Bigas, 1999; Li et al., 1998), not simply T-cell lineage choice. A particularly exciting recent finding in 2002 was the

ability of Notch pathway activation to sustain multipotent hematopoietic stem-cell-like activity (Varnum-Finney et al., 2000). Thus, even if Notch signaling enhanced T-cell development, it could do this in a very indirect way, simply by promoting the continued production of stem cells that had T-cell potential among other options. In this case, T cells might be produced only under conditions of Notch signaling, but they would be produced rather nonspecifically, together with many other cell types.

Second, T-cell development is a multi-step process that required an ordered progression of regulatory changes, not a simple "on" signal. This was evident from much research in the literature at the time, as I reviewed (Rothenberg, 2000), and was well supported by the stage-to-stage discontinuities in the roles of supporting cytokines (Di Santo et al., 1999) and intrinsic transcription factors (Engel et al., 2001). Any of a number of different regulatory deficiencies were known to block cells at early stages of this process and prevent generation of T-cell receptor-expressing cells (Staal et al., 2001). The expression of cytoplasmic CD3, such as that which is reported in Jaleco et al. (Jaleco et al., 2001), occurs at a relatively early stage of this process. It is not an indicator of success in generating immunologically significant, T-cell receptor-positive cells.

Third, T-cell development was known to fail on conventional stromal monolayer cocultures, even using thymic epithelial cells. This was a subject of much discussion at T-cell development meetings in the late 1990's and early 2000's. It was known that early T-cell development could proceed well in the three-dimensional structure of an organ culture but could not be sustained when the organ's own stromal cells were dissociated (Anderson et al., 1996; van Ewijk et al., 1999; Anderson and Jenkinson, 2001). This was not interpreted in terms of Notch ligand presentation, but rather in terms of the need for organized cell-cell interactions. The clear awareness that T-cell development depended on distinct, sequential regulatory signals as described above gave a simple explanation of why a complex architectural organization might be needed for correct guidance of development. This is relevant to answer the question of why it was not "obvious" to turn to OP9 cells as the solution to the T-cell problem. If even thymic epithelial cells themselves supported only partial, abortive T-cell differentiation, then why should any stromal line be better? If the problem was sequentiality of signals, then why should any homogeneous monolayer system work to support T-cell development for more than one or two stage transitions?

7. To summarize, the success of any attempt like that the inventors was viewed at the time as highly unlikely on the basis of these three facts about the complex roles of Notch, the discontinuous, multistep nature of T-cell

development, and the paradigm that 3-D organ structure was needed to induce and sustain T-cell development.

Each of the references cited by the Examiner added some background for the eventual success of the inventors, but they did not make it "obvious".

- The report by Jaleco et al. (Jaleco et al., 2001) was extremely important to show that different Notch ligands had different effects on the T and B lineage development of precursors, and to focus attention on Delta family ligands. However, the T-cell development that group obtained was extremely inefficient, rare, slow, and even questionable as to whether it was T-lineage at all. Knowing that the main problem in the T-cell field at the time was to generate a full multistage progression of T-lineage development, the tiny and slowly accumulating yield of potential T- and NK-lineage cells generated by Jaleco et al. did not make a serious impact.
- Similarly, it was not at all obvious why the OP9 stroma would do better than the S17 cells used by Jaleco et al. for this particular purpose. The feature of OP9 cells that was known was its lack of macrophage growth factor production; there was no evidence yet for any positive features they might have that would optimize T-cell development. The lack of macrophage growth factor was known to be helpful for B cell development from ES cells (Nakano et al., 1994), but it was not required to make B

cells from hematopoietic stem cells; indeed, the S17 cells used by Jaleco et al. were the standard for support of B cell development in vitro. Furthermore, while there was some precedent for hematopoietic precursors making binary choices between B and macrophage fates (Cumano et al., 1992), there was no conceptual foundation for why this should be an issue for T cells. In retrospect, OP9 cells are known to produce Wnt and Kit ligands that are likely to be critical for their support of T-cell development, but this was learned only after the fact.

An in vitro culture system in which a tiny percentage of cells adopt a partial, desired fate among a majority doing other things is not in any way the equivalent of an in vitro system that channels cells with high efficiency, reproducibility, and sustained effect throughout an extended differentiation process. The discovery that OP9-DL1 (or OP9-DL4) cells could indeed induce and sustain such a complex developmental program was not only a truly novel invention but also a paradigm-shattering discovery about the nature of T-cell development. The explosion of publications and the complete reorientation of the field that the inventors made possible are the highest expert testimony to its originality.

8. I declare further that all statements made herein of my own knowledge are true and that all statements made on information and belief are believed to be



true and, further, that these statements were made with the knowledge that willful false statements and the like so made are punishable by fine or imprisonment, or both, under Section 1001 of Title 18 of the United States Code and that such a willful false statement may jeopardize the validity of the application or any patent issuing thereon.

12 January 2009

Date

Ellen Rothenberg

Ellen Rothenberg

## CURRICULUM VITAE

Ellen V. Rothenberg

### Education:

Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts  
September 1969-June 1972  
A.B. summa cum laude in Biochemical Sciences, 1972  
Harvard University--Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Boston, Massachusetts  
September 1972-January 1973  
Joint program in Health Sciences and Technology  
Courses toward M.D.  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, Massachusetts  
Department of Biology and Center for Cancer Research  
September 1972-January 1977  
Ph.D. in Cell Biology, 1977 (advisor: David Baltimore)  
Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center, New York, New York  
Department of Cell Surface Immunogenetics  
November 1977-September 1979  
Postdoctoral (advisor: Edward A. Boyse)

### Positions Held:

Teaching Assistant--Massachusetts Institute of Technology, General Biology  
(supervisor: Salvador Luria) February 1974-June 1974  
NSF Predoctoral Research Fellow--MIT, September 1973-August 1976  
Research Associate--Center for Cancer Research, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
(advisor: David Baltimore), February 1977-October 1977  
Postdoctoral Research Fellow--Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center, New York, New York,  
November 1977-September 1979  
Assistant Research Professor--The Salk Institute for Biological Studies, Department of Cancer  
Biology, September 1979-May 1982  
Assistant Professor of Biology--California Institute of Technology, Division of Biology,  
Pasadena, California, June 1982-June 1988  
Associate Professor of Biology--California Institute of Technology, Division of Biology,  
Pasadena, California, July 1988-August 1994.  
Professor of Biology--California Institute of Technology, Division of Biology, Pasadena, CA,  
September 1994-present  
Albert Billings Ruddock Professor of Biology--California Institute of Technology, Division of  
Biology, Pasadena, CA, April 2007-present

### Honors and Awards:

National Merit Scholar, 1969

Phi Beta Kappa, 1971

A.B. summa cum laude, Harvard University, 1972

National Science Foundation Predoctoral Fellowship, 1973-1976

Jane Coffin Childs Memorial Fund for Medical Research Postdoctoral Fellowship, 1977-1979

Biology Undergraduate Students Advisory Council Award for excellence in teaching, 1988

Ferguson Prize for Undergraduate Teaching, 1995

Associated Students of Caltech (ASCIT) Award for Excellence in Undergraduate Teaching, 1998

Ferguson Prize for Undergraduate Teaching, 1999

Biology Undergraduate Students Advisory Committee Award for Excellence in Teaching, 2001

Biology Undergraduate Students Advisory Committee Award for Excellence in Teaching, 2003-2004

Associated Students of Caltech (ASCIT) Award for Excellence in Undergraduate Teaching, 2007

### **Professional Societies:**

American Society for Microbiology (former)

Sigma Xi (former)

AAAS (active)

American Association of Immunologists (active)

New York Academy of Sciences (former)

### **Committee Memberships and Editorial Boards:**

Council Member--Midwinter Conference of Immunologists, 1/1981-1/1986

Member of review committee--American Cancer Society (California Division) Postdoctoral Fellowship Program, 9/1982-8/1985

Associate Editor, Journal of Molecular and Cellular Immunology, 1984-

Associate Editor, Journal of Immunology, 7/1986-6/1991

Associate Editor, Molecular Reproduction and Development, 1987-1997

Member, Awards Committee, American Association of Immunologists, 7/1986-6/1989

Member, Immunological Sciences Study Section, Division of Research Grants, National Institutes of Health/Public Health Service, 9/1988-6/1992

Program (Block) Chairman, American Association of Immunologists, T Cells (Block B), 1989-1992

Member of review committee--American Cancer Society (California Division) Postdoctoral Fellowship Screening Panel, 9/1992-7/1995 (2nd term)

American Institute of Biological Sciences Scientific Working Group and Peer Review Panel to NASA: Physiological and Anatomical Rodent Experiment.04, 1992-1994

Member, Scientific Advisory Board, Hereditary Disease Foundation, 5/1991-2/1995

Member, NIAID-NIA Task Force on Immunology and Aging, 1994

International Union of Immunology Societies designated reporter for 9th International Congress of Immunology, 1995

Member, National Research Council panel for review of Howard Hughes Medical Institute Predoctoral Fellowships in the Biological Sciences, 1996

Faculty, American Association of Immunologists Advanced Course in Immunology, July 1996  
 Editorial Board Member, *Journal of Clinical Immunology*, 1997-2000  
 Editorial Board Member, *Developmental and Comparative Immunology*, 1997-2000  
 Member, External Advisory Board, The Lerner Research Institute (Cancer Center), Cleveland Clinic Foundation, 1997-2003  
 Founding organizer, Aegean Conference on Gene Regulation in Lymphocyte Development, and co-chairman, 2002-2004  
 Faculty, Japanese Society for Immunology summer immunology course, 2004  
 Section Editor, *Journal of Immunology*, 2004-2006  
 Associate Editor, *Immunity*, January 2005 –  
 Scientific Advisory Board, La Jolla Institute for Allergy and Immunology: 2005 – present.  
 Faculty, AAI Advanced Immunology Course, July 2005, July 2006.  
 Program (Block) Co-Chairman, American Association of Immunologists, Hematopoiesis and Immune System Development, 2007-2010.  
 Editorial Board member, *Immunological Reviews*, 2009-2014.  
 Co-organizer, FASEB summer conference “Molecular Mechanisms of Lymphocyte Differentiation”, 2009  
 14<sup>th</sup> International Congress of Immunology Program Committee, 2010

Site visitor and ad hoc reviewer for NCI, NIA, and CSR (NIH); NASA; other agencies

### **Publications:**

1. Rothenberg, E. and D. Baltimore. 1976. Synthesis of long, representative DNA copies of the murine RNA tumor virus genome. *J. Virol.* **17**, 168-174.
2. Haseltine, W. A., D. G. Kleid, A. Panet, E. Rothenberg and D. Baltimore. 1976. Ordered transcription of RNA tumor virus genomes. *J. Mol. Biol.* **106**, 109-131.
3. Rothenberg, E. and D. Baltimore. 1977. Increased length of DNA made by virions of murine leukemia virus at limiting magnesium ion concentration. *J. Virol.* **21**, 168-178.
4. Rothenberg, E., D. Smotkin, D. Baltimore and R. A. Weinberg. 1977. *In vitro* synthesis of infectious DNA of murine leukemia virus. *Nature* (London) **269**, 122-126.
5. Rothenberg, E., D. J. Donoghue and D. Baltimore. 1978. Analysis of a 5' leader sequence on murine leukemia virus 21S RNA; heteroduplex mapping with long reverse transcriptase products. *Cell* **13**, 435-451.
6. Donoghue, D. J., E. Rothenberg, N. Hopkins, D. Baltimore and P. A. Sharp. 1978. Heteroduplex analysis of the nonhomology region between Moloney MuLV and the dual host range derivative HIX virus. *Cell* **14**, 959-970.

7. Shields, A., O. N. Witte, E. Rothenberg and D. Baltimore. 1978. High frequency of aberrant expression of Moloney murine leukemia virus in clonal interactions. *Cell* **14**, 601-609.
8. Baltimore, D., E. Gilboa, E. Rothenberg and F. Yoshimura. 1979. Production of a discrete infectious, double-stranded DNA by reverse transcription in virions of Moloney leukemia virus. *Cold Spring Harbor Symp. in Quant. Biol.* **43**, 869-874.
9. Rothenberg, E. and E. A. Boyse. 1979. Synthesis and processing of molecules bearing thymus leukemia antigen. *J. Exp. Med.* **150**, 777-791.
10. Rothenberg, E. 1980. Expression of differentiation antigens in subpopulations of mouse thymocytes: regulation at the level of de novo synthesis. *Cell* **20**, 1-9.
11. Michaelson, J., E. Rothenberg and E. A. Boyse. 1980. Genetic polymorphism of murine  $\beta_2$ -microglobulin detected biochemically. *Immunogenetics* **11**, 93-95.
12. Rothenberg, E. and D. Triglia. 1980. *In vitro* maintenance of differentiation marker synthesis by subpopulations of mouse thymocytes. *Proc. 1980 ICN-UCLA Symp. on Control of Cellular Division and Development and J. Supramolec. Struct.* **14**, 371-382.
13. Triglia, D. and E. Rothenberg. 1981. "Mature" thymocytes are not glucocorticoid-resistant *in vitro*. *J. Immunol.* **127**, 64-68.
14. Rothenberg, E. and D. Triglia. 1981. Structure and expression of glycoproteins controlled by the *Qa-1<sup>a</sup>* allele. *Immunogenetics* **14**, 455-468.
15. Rothenberg, E. 1982. A specific biosynthetic marker for immature thymic lymphoblasts: active synthesis of thymus-leukemia antigen restricted to proliferating cells. *J. Exp. Med.* **155**, 140-154.
16. Rothenberg, E. 1982. What is the role of T-lymphocyte surveillance in neoplastic disease? *Am. J. Surgery* **143**, 664-669.
17. Rothenberg, E. and D. Triglia. 1983. Lyt-2 glycoprotein is synthesized as a single molecular species. *J. Exp. Med.* **157**, 365-370.
18. Rothenberg, E. and D. Triglia. 1983. Clonal proliferation unlinked to terminal deoxynucleotidyl transferase synthesis in thymocytes of young mice. *J. Immunol.* **130**, 1627-1633.
19. Rothenberg, E., B. Caplan, J. Trotter and D. Triglia. 1984. Thymic lymphoblasts: heterogeneity and developmental fates. In *Recognition and Regulation in Cell-Mediated Immunity*. J. D. Watson and J. Marbrook (Eds.). Marcel Dekker, Inc., New York, pp. 61-86.

20. Caplan, B. and E. Rothenberg. 1984. High-level secretion of interleukin-2 by a subset of proliferating thymic lymphoblasts. *J. Immunol.* **133**, 1983-1991.
21. Haas, M., A. Altman, E. Rothenberg, M. H. Bogart and O. W. Jones. 1984. Mechanism of T-cell lymphomagenesis: transformation of growth-factor-dependent T-lymphoblastoma cells to growth-factor-independent T-lymphoma cells. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **81**, 1742-1746.
22. Rothenberg, E., B. Caplan and R. D. Sailor. 1984. Toward a molecular basis for growth control in T-lymphocyte development. In *Molecular Biology of Development*. UCLA Symposia on Molecular and Cellular Biology, New Series, Vol. 19. E. H. Davidson and R. A. Firtel (Eds.). Alan R. Liss, Inc., New York, pp. 511-525.
23. Lugo, J. P., S. N. Krishnan, R. D. Sailor, P. Koen, T. Malek and E. Rothenberg. 1985. Proliferation of thymic stem cells with and without receptors for interleukin-2: implications for intrathymic antigen recognition. *J. Exp. Med.*, **161**, 1048-1062.
24. Rothenberg, E. and J. P. Lugo. 1985. Differentiation and cell division in the mammalian thymus. *Dev. Biol.* **112**, 1-17.
25. Lugo, J. P., S. N. Krishnan, R. Diamond Sailor and E. V. Rothenberg. 1986. Early precursor thymocytes can produce interleukin 2 upon stimulation with calcium ionophore and phorbol ester. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **83**, 1862-1866.
26. Novak, T. J. and E. V. Rothenberg. 1986. Differential transient and long-term expression of DNA sequences introduced into T lymphocyte lines. *DNA* **5**, 439-451.
27. Kinnon C., R. A. Diamond and E. Rothenberg. 1986. Activation of T-cell antigen receptor  $\alpha$  and  $\beta$  chain genes in the thymus. Implications for the lineages of developing cortical thymocytes. *J. Immunol.* **137**, 4010-4015.
28. Rothenberg, E. V., C. Kinnon, K. L. McGuire, J. P. Lugo and R. A. Diamond. 1987. Activation of receptor and response genes in T lymphocyte development. In *Molecular Approaches to Developmental Biology*, UCLA Symposia on Molecular and Cellular Biology, New Series, Vol. 51. R. A. Firtel and E. H. Davidson (Eds.). Alan R. Liss, Inc., New York, pp. 453-467.
29. Haas, M., A. Altman, E. Rothenberg, M. H. Bogart and O. W. Jones. 1987. Radiation leukemia virus and x-irradiation induce in C57BL/6 mice two distinct T-cell neoplasms: a growth factor-dependent lymphoma and a growth factor-independent lymphoma. *Leukemia Res.* **11**, 223-239.
30. McGuire, K. L. and E. V. Rothenberg. 1987. Inducibility of interleukin-2 (IL2) RNA expression in individual mature and immature T lymphocytes. *EMBO J.* **6**, 939-946.

31. Kinnon, C., K. L. McGuire and E. V. Rothenberg. 1987. Differential regulation of T-cell receptor gamma genes in immature thymocyte populations. *Eur. J. Immunol.* **17**, 1265-1269.
32. Boyer, P. D. and E. V. Rothenberg. 1988. Interleukin-2 receptor inducibility is blocked in cortical-type thymocytes. *J. Immunol.* **140**, 2886-2892.
33. McGuire, K. L., J. A. Yang and E. V. Rothenberg. 1988. Influence of activating stimulus on functional phenotype: interleukin-2 mRNA accumulation differentially induced by ionophore and receptor ligands in subsets of murine T cells. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **85**, 6503-6507.
34. Rothenberg, E. V., K. L. McGuire, and P. D. Boyer. 1988. Molecular indices of functional competence in developing T cells. *Immunol. Rev.* **104**, 29-53.
35. Boyer, P. D., R. A. Diamond and E. V. Rothenberg. 1989. Changes in inducibility of interleukin-2 receptor alpha chain and T-cell receptor expression during thymocyte differentiation in the mouse. *J. Immunol.* **142**, 4121-4130.
36. Rothenberg, E. V. 1989. The long road to functional maturity for developing T cells. *Immunology Today* **10**, 116-117.
37. Rothenberg, E. V. and D. DeLuca. 1990. Discussion summary: Lymphocyte evolution and development. In *Defense Molecules*, UCLA Symposia on Molecular and Cellular Biology, New Series, Vol. 121. J. J. Marchalonis and C. Reinisch (Eds.). Alan R. Liss, Inc., New York, pp. 235-239.
38. Rothenberg, E. V., R. A. Diamond, K. A. Pepper and J. A. Yang. 1990. Interleukin-2 gene inducibility in T cells prior to T-cell receptor expression: changes in signaling pathways and gene expression requirements during intrathymic maturation. *J. Immunol.* **144**, 1614-1624.
39. Rothenberg, E. V., R. A. Diamond, T. J. Novak, K. A. Pepper and J. A. Yang. 1990. Mechanisms of effector lineage commitment in T lymphocyte development. In *Developmental Biology*, UCLA Symposia on Molecular and Cellular Biology, New Series, Vol. 125. E. H. Davidson, J. Ruderman and J. Posakony (Eds.). Alan R. Liss, Inc., New York, pp. 225-249.
40. Rothenberg, E. V. 1990. Death and transfiguration of cortical thymocytes: A reconsideration. *Immunol. Today* **11**, 116-119.
41. Novak, T. J., P. M. White, and E. V. Rothenberg. 1990. Regulatory anatomy of the murine interleukin-2 gene. *Nucl. Acids Res.* **18**, 4523-4533.

42. Rothenberg, E. V. 1990. Developmental shifts in signaling pathways for lymphokine production and growth response. In *Forum on Interleukins and T-Cell Development*, C. Martinez-A., (Ed.). Research in Immunology **141**, 289-293.
43. Novak, T. J. and E. V. Rothenberg. 1990. cAMP inhibits induction of IL2 but not of IL4 in T cells. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **87**, 9353-9357.
44. Novak, T. J., D. Chen, and E. V. Rothenberg. 1990. Interleukin 1 synergy with phosphoinositide pathway agonists for induction of interleukin 2 gene expression: Molecular basis of costimulation. *Mol. Cell. Biol.* **10**, 6325-6334.
45. Rothenberg, E. V., D. Chen, R. A. Diamond, M. Dohadwala, T. J. Novak, P. M. White, and J. A. Yang-Snyder. 1991. Acquisition of mature functional responsiveness in T cells: Programming for function via signaling. In: *Mechanisms of Lymphocyte Activation and Immune Regulation III*, S. Gupta, W. C. Paul, M. D. Cooper, and E. V. Rothenberg (Eds.). Plenum Publishing Corp., New York, NY, pp. 71-83.
46. Rothenberg, E. V. 1991. Cell separation and analysis: a strategic overview. *Methods: A Companion to Methods in Enzymology* **2**, 168-172.
47. Novak, T. J., F. K. Yoshimura, and E. V. Rothenberg. 1992. *In vitro* transfection of fresh thymocytes and T cells shows subset-specific expression of viral promoters. *Mol. Cell. Biol.* **12**, 1515-1527.
48. Rothenberg, E. V. 1992. The development of functionally responsive T cells. *Adv. Immunol.* **51**, 85-214.
49. Chen, D. and E. V. Rothenberg. 1993. Molecular basis for developmental changes in interleukin-2 gene inducibility. *Mol. Cell. Biol.* **13**, 228-237.
50. Yang-Snyder, J. A. and E. V. Rothenberg. 1993. Developmental and anatomical patterns of IL-2 gene expression *in vivo* in the murine thymus. *Devel. Immunol.* **3**, 85-102.
51. Rothenberg, E. V., D. Chen, and R. A. Diamond. 1993. Functional and phenotypic analysis of thymocytes in SCID mice: evidence for functional response transitions before and after the SCID arrest point. *J. Immunol.* **151**, 3530-3546.
52. Garritty, P. A., D. Chen, E. V. Rothenberg and B. J. Wold. 1994. IL-2 transcription is regulated *in vivo* at the level of coordinated binding of both constitutive and regulated factors. *Mol. Cell. Biol.* **14**, 2159-2169.
53. Rothenberg, E. V. and R. A. Diamond. 1994. Costimulation by interleukin-1 of multiple activation responses in a developmentally restricted subset of immature thymocytes. *Eur. J. Immunol.* **24**, 24-33.



54. Chen, D. and E. V. Rothenberg. 1994. Interleukin-2 transcription factors as molecular targets of cAMP inhibition: delayed inhibition kinetics and combinatorial transcription roles. *J. Exp. Med.* **179**, 931-942.
55. Rothenberg, E. V. 1994. Signaling mechanisms in thymocyte selection. *Curr. Opin. Immunol.* **6**, 257-265.
56. Rothenberg, E. V., R. A. Diamond, and D. Chen. 1994. Programming for recognition and programming for response: separate developmental subroutines in the murine thymus. *Thymus* **22**, 215-244.
57. Lindenboim, L., R. Diamond, E. Rothenberg, and R. Stein. 1995. Apoptosis induced by serum-deprivation of PC12 cells is not preceded by growth arrest and can occur at each phase of the cell cycle. *Cancer Res.* **55**, 1242-1247.
58. Scherer, L. J., R. A. Diamond, and E. V. Rothenberg. 1995. Developmental regulation of cAMP signaling pathways in thymocyte development. *Thymus* **23**, 231-257.
59. Reya, T., J. A. Yang-Snyder, E. V. Rothenberg, and S. R. Carding. 1996. Regulated expression and function of IL2/IL15R- $\beta$  (CD122) during lymphoid development. *Blood* **87**, 190-201.
60. Rothenberg, E. V. 1995. Developmental biology of lymphocytes. *The Immunologist* **3**, 172-175.
61. Rothenberg, E. V. and Ward, S. B. 1996. A dynamic assembly of diverse transcription factors integrates activation and cell-type information for interleukin-2 gene regulation. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **93**, 9358-9365.
62. Rothenberg, E. V. 1996. How T cells count. *Science* **273**, 78-79.
63. Diamond, R. A., Ward, S. B., Owada-Makabe, K., Wang, H., and Rothenberg, E. V. 1997. Different developmental arrest points in RAG-2<sup>-/-</sup> and *scid* thymocytes on two genetic backgrounds: developmental choices and cell death mechanisms before TCR gene rearrangement. *J. Immunol.* **158**, 4052-4064.
64. Yang-Snyder, J. A., and Rothenberg, E. V. 1998. Spontaneous expression of interleukin-2 *in vivo* in specific tissues of young mice. *Devel. Immunol.* **5**, 223-245.
65. Wang, H., Diamond, R. A., and Rothenberg, E. V. 1998. Cross-lineage expression of Ig- $\beta$  (B29) in thymocytes: positive and negative gene regulation to establish T-cell identity. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **95**, 6831-6836.
66. Rothenberg, E. V. 1998. Gene regulation in T-cell lineage commitment. In: *Molecular Biology of B-Cell and T-Cell Development*, J. G. Monroe and E. V. Rothenberg (Eds.), Humana Press, Totowa, NJ, pp.337-365.

67. Ward, S. B., Hernandez-Hoyos, G., Chen, F., Waterman, M., Reeves, R., and Rothenberg, E. V. 1998. Chromatin remodeling of the interleukin-2 gene: distinct alterations in the proximal versus distal enhancer regions. *Nucl. Acids Res.* **26**, 2923-2934.
68. Wang, H., Diamond, R. A., Yang-Snyder, J. A., and Rothenberg, E. V. 1998. Precocious expression of T-cell functional response genes *in vivo* in primitive thymocytes before T-lineage commitment. *Int. Immunol.* **10**, 1623-1635.
69. Chen, F., Chen, D., and Rothenberg, E. V. 1999. Specific regulation of Fos family transcription factors in thymocytes at two developmental checkpoints. *Int. Immunol.* **11**, 677-688.
70. Rothenberg, E. V., Telfer, J. C., and Anderson, M. K. 1999. Transcriptional regulation of lymphocyte lineage commitment. *BioEssays* **21**, 726-742.
71. Anderson, M. K. and Rothenberg, E. V. 2000. Transcription factor expression in lymphocyte development: Clues to the evolutionary origins of lymphoid cell lineages? *Curr. Top. Microbiol. Immunol.* **248**, 137-155.
72. Anderson, M. K., Hernandez-Hoyos, G., Diamond, R. A., and Rothenberg, E. V. 1999. Precise developmental regulation of Ets family transcription factors during specification and commitment to the T cell lineage. *Development* **126**, 3131-3148.
73. Hernandez-Hoyos, G., Sohn, S. J., Rothenberg, E. V., and Alberola-Ila, J. 2000. Lck activity controls CD4/CD8 T-cell lineage commitment. *Immunity* **12**, 313-322.
74. Rothenberg, E. V., Ward, S. B., Yui, M., Hernandez-Hoyos, G., Chen, F., Bardhan, S., Chen, R., Hotz, R., and Yang-Snyder, J. A. 2001. Developmental specificity of interleukin-2 expression. In: S. Umlauf & B. Beverly, eds. *Interleukin-2 (IL-2) Transcription*. Landes Biosciences, Austin, TX & eureka.com.
75. Telfer, J. C. and Rothenberg, E. V. 2001. Expression and function of a stem-cell promoter for the murine CBF $\alpha$ 2 gene: distinct roles and regulation in natural killer and T cell development. *Devel. Biol.* **229**, 363-382.
76. Rothenberg, E. V. 2000. Stepwise specification of lymphocyte developmental lineages. *Curr. Opin. Genet. Dev.* **10**, 370-379.
77. Yui, M. A., Hernandez-Hoyos, G., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2001. A new regulatory region of the murine IL-2 locus that confers position-independent transgene expression. *J. Immunol.* **166**, 1730-1739.
78. Makita, T., Hernandez-Hoyos, G., Chen, T. H.-P., Wu, H., Rothenberg, E. V., and Sucov, H. M. 2001. A developmental transition in definitive erythropoiesis: erythropoietin

expression is sequentially regulated by retinoic acid receptors and HNF4. *Genes Dev.* **15**, 912-924.

79. Chen, F., Rowen, L., Hood, L., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2001. Differential transcriptional regulation of individual T-cell receptor V $\beta$  segments before gene rearrangement. *J. Immunol.* **166**, 1771-1780.
80. Anderson, M. K., Sun, X., Miracle, A. L., Litman, G. W., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2001. Evolution of hematopoiesis: three members of the PU.1 transcription factor family in a cartilaginous fish, *Raja eglanteria*. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **98**, 553-558.
81. Miracle, A. L., Anderson, M. K., Litman, R. T., Walsh, C. J., Luer, C. A., Rothenberg, E. V., and Litman, G. W. 2001. Complex expression patterns of lymphocyte-specific genes during the development of cartilaginous fish implicate unique lymphoid tissues in generating an immune repertoire. *Int. Immunol.* **13**, 567-580.
82. Rothenberg, E. V. 2001. Notchless T cell maturation?. *Nature Immunol.* **2**, 189-190.
83. Rothenberg, E. V. 2001. Commentary: Mapping of complex regulatory elements by pufferfish/zebrafish transgenesis. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **98**, 6540-6542.
84. Anderson, M. K., Weiss, A. H., Hernandez-Hoyos, G., Dionne, C. J., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2002. Constitutive expression of PU.1 in fetal hematopoietic progenitors blocks T cell development at the pro-T cell stage. *Immunity* **16**, 285-296.
85. Rothenberg, E. V. and Davidson, E. H. 2002. Regulatory cooptions in the evolution of the immune systems of the deuterostomes. In: R. A. B. Ezekowitz & J. A. Hoffmann (eds.) *Innate Immunity*. Humana Press, Totowa, N. J. pp. 61-87.
86. Rothenberg, E. V. and Anderson, M. K. 2002. Elements of transcription factor network design for T-lineage specification. *Devel. Biol.* **246**, 29-44.
87. Anderson, M. K., Hernandez-Hoyos, G., Dionne, C. J., Arias, A. M., Chen, D., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2002. Definition of regulatory network elements for T-cell development by perturbation analysis with PU.1 and GATA-3. *Devel. Biol.* **246**, 103-121.
88. Rothenberg, E. V. 2002. T lineage specification and commitment: a gene regulation perspective. *Semin. Immunol.* **14**, 431-440.
89. Rothenberg, E. V., Telfer, J. D., and Yui, M. A. 2003. T cell developmental biology. In: W. E. Paul (ed.) *Fundamental Immunology*, 5<sup>th</sup> Edition. Lippincott/Williams & Wilkins. Chapter 9, pp. 259-301.
90. Rothenberg, E. V. and Dionne, C. J. 2002. Lineage plasticity and commitment in T-cell development. *Immunol. Rev.* **187**, 96-115.

91. Hernández-Hoyos, G., Anderson, M. K., Wang, C., Rothenberg, E. V., and Alberola-Ila, J. 2003. GATA-3 expression is controlled by TCR signals and regulates CD4/CD8 differentiation. *Immunity* **19**, 83-94.
92. Warren, L. A. and Rothenberg, E. V. 2003. Regulatory coding of lymphoid lineage choice by hematopoietic transcription factors. *Curr. Opin. Immunol.* **15**, 166-175.
93. Yui, M. A., Sharp, L. L., Havran, W. L., and E. V. Rothenberg. 2004. Preferential activation of an Interleukin-2 (IL-2) regulatory sequence transgene in TCR $\gamma\delta$  and NKT cells: subset-specific differences in IL-2 regulation. *J. Immunol.* **172**, 4691-4699.
94. Telfer, J. C., Hedblom, E. E., Anderson, M. K., Laurent, M. N., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2004. Localization of the domains in Runx transcription factors required for the repression of CD4 in thymocytes. *J. Immunol.* **172**, 4359-4370.
95. Anderson, M. K., Pant, R., Miracle, A. L., Sun, X., Luer, C. A., Walsh, C. J., Telfer, J. C., Litman, G. W., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2004. Evolutionary origins of lymphocytes: Ensembles of T-cell and B-cell transcriptional regulators in a cartilaginous fish. *J. Immunol.* **172**, 5851-5860.
96. Rothenberg, E. V. 2004. From totipotency to T in a dish. *Nature Immunol.* **5**, 359-360.
97. Rothenberg, E. V. and Pant, R. 2004. Origins of lymphocyte developmental programs: Transcription factor evidence. *Semin. Immunol.* **16**, 227-238.
98. Yui, M. A. and Rothenberg, E. V. 2004. Deranged early T cell development in immunodeficient strains of non-obese diabetic (NOD) mice. *J. Immunol.* **173**, 5381-5391.
99. Rothenberg, E. V. and Taghon, T. 2005. Molecular genetics of T-cell development. *Annu. Rev. Immunol.* **23**, 601-649.
100. Dionne, C. J., Tse, K. Y., Weiss, A. H., Franco, C. B., Wiest, D. L., Anderson, M. K., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2005. Subversion of T lineage commitment by PU.1 in a clonal cell line system. *Devel. Biol.* **280**, 448-466.
101. Rothenberg, E. V. 2005. Thymic regulation – hidden in plain sight. *Science* **307** (5711), 858-859.
102. Taghon, T., David, E.-S., Zúñiga-Pflücker, J. C., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2005. Delayed, asynchronous, and reversible T-lineage specification induced by Notch/Delta signaling. *Genes Dev.* **19**, 965-978.

103. Adachi, S., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2005. Cell type-specific epigenetic marking of the *IL2* gene at a distal *cis*-regulatory region in competent, nontranscribing T cells. *Nucl. Acids Res.* **33**, 3200-3210.
104. Taghon, T., Yui, M. A., Pant, R., Diamond, R. A., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2006. Developmental and molecular characterization of emerging  $\beta$ - and  $\gamma\delta$ -selected pre-T cells in the adult mouse thymus. *Immunity* **24**, 53-64.
105. David-Fung, E.-S., Yui, M. A., Morales, M., Wang, H., Taghon, T., Diamond, R. A., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2006. Progression of regulatory gene expression states in fetal and adult pro-T cell development. *Immunol. Rev.* **209**, 212-236.
106. Wang, D., Claus, C. L., Vaccarelli, G., Braunstein, M., Schmitt, T. M., Zúñiga-Pflücker, J.-C., Rothenberg, E. V., and Anderson, M. K. 2006. The basic helix-loop-helix transcription factor HEBAlt is expressed in pro-T cells and enhances the generation of T cell precursors. *J. Immunol.* **177**, 109-119.
107. Franco, C. B., Scripture-Adams, D. D., Proekt, I., Taghon, T., Weiss, A. H., Yui, M. A., Adams, S. L., Diamond, R. A., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2006. Notch/Delta signaling constrains re-engineering of pro-T cells by PU.1. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **103**, 11993-11998.
108. Rothenberg, E. V. 2007. Cell lineage regulators in B and T cell development. *Nat. Immunol.* **8**, 441-444.
109. Rothenberg, E. V. 2007. Regulatory factors for initial T-lymphocyte lineage specification. *Curr. Opin. Hematol.* **14**, 322-329.
110. Tydell, C. C., David-Fung, E.-S., Moore, J. E., Rowen, L., Taghon, T., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2007. Molecular dissection of prethymic progenitor entry into the T lymphocyte developmental pathway. *J. Immunol.* **179**, 421-438.
111. Rothenberg, E. V. 2007. Negotiation of the T-lineage fate decision by transcription factor interplay and microenvironmental signals. *Immunity* **26**, 690-702.
112. Taghon, T., Yui, M. A., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2007. Mast cell lineage diversion of T lineage precursor cells by the essential T cell transcription factor GATA-3. *Nat. Immunol.* **8**, 845-855.
113. Rothenberg, E. V., Moore, J. E., and Yui, M. A. 2008. Launching the T-lineage developmental programme. *Nat. Rev. Immunol.* **8**, 9-21.
114. Rothenberg, E. V. and Yui, M. A. 2008. Development of T cells. In: W. E. Paul, (ed.) *Fundamental Immunology, 6<sup>th</sup> Edition*. Lippincott, Williams & Wilkins, Chapter 12, pp. 376-406.

115. Guo, Y., Maillard, I., Chakraborti, S., Rothenberg, E. V., and Speck, N. A. 2008. Core binding factors are necessary for natural killer cell development, and cooperate with Notch signaling during T cell specification. *Blood* **112**, 480-492.
116. Rothenberg, E. V. 2008. Erg in stem cells: a function emerges. *Nat. Immunol.* **9**, 714-716.
117. Rothenberg, E. V. and Scripture-Adams, D. D. 2008. Competition and collaboration: GATA-3, PU.1, and Notch signaling in early T-cell fate determination. *Semin. Immunol.* **20**, 236-246.
118. Georgescu, C., Longabaugh, W. J. R., Scripture-Adams, D. D., David-Fung, E.-S., Yui, M. A., Zarnegar, M. A., Bolouri, H., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2008. A gene regulatory network armature for T-lymphocyte specification. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **105**, 20100–20105. doi: 10.1073/pnas.0806501105.
119. Taghon, T. and Rothenberg, E. V. 2008. Molecular mechanisms that control mouse and human TCR- $\alpha\beta$  and TCR- $\gamma\delta$  T cell development. *Semin. Immunopathol.* **30**, 383-398.
120. David-Fung, E.-S., Butler, R., Buzi, G., Yui, M. A., Diamond, R. A., Anderson, M. K., Rowen, L., and Rothenberg, E. V. 2009. Transcription factor expression dynamics of early T-lymphocyte specification and commitment. *Devel. Biol.* **325**, 444–467. doi: 10.1016/j.ydbio.2008.10.021.
121. Rothenberg, E. V. 2009. Decision by committee: new light on the CD4/CD8-lineage choice. *Immunol. Cell Biol.*, in press. doi:10.1038/icb.2008.100.

## Appendix B

- Anderson,G. and Jenkinson,E.J. (2001). Lymphostromal interactions in thymic development and function. *Nat. Rev. Immunol.* *1*, 31-40.
- Anderson,G., Moore,N.C., Owen,J.J., and Jenkinson,E.J. (1996). Cellular interactions in thymocyte development. *Annu. Rev. Immunol.* *14*, 73-99.
- Cumano,A., Paige,C.J., Iscove,N.N., and Brady,G. (1992). Bipotential precursors of B cells and macrophages in murine fetal liver. *Nature* *356*, 612-615.
- Defetos,M.L., Huang,E., Ojala,E.W., Forbush,K.A., and Bevan,M.J. (2000). Notch1 signaling promotes the maturation of CD4 and CD8 SP thymocytes. *Immunity* *13*, 73-84.
- Di Santo,J.P., Aifantis,I., Rosmaraki,E., Garcia,C., Fainberg,J., Fehling,H.J., Fischer,A., von Boehmer,H., and Rocha,B. (1999). The common cytokine receptor  $\gamma$  chain and the pre-T cell receptor provide independent but critically overlapping signals in early  $\alpha/\beta$  T cell development. *J. Exp. Med.* *189*, 563-573.
- Engel,I., Johns,C., Bain,G., Rivera,R.R., and Murre,C. (2001). Early thymocyte development is regulated by modulation of E2A protein activity. *J. Exp. Med.* *194*, 733-746.
- Jaleco,A.C., Neves,H., Hooijberg,E., Gameiro,P., Clode,N., Haury,M., Henrique,D., and Parreira,L. (2001). Differential effects of Notch ligands Delta-1 and Jagged-1 in human lymphoid differentiation. *J. Exp. Med.* *194*, 991-1002.
- Lam,L.T., Ronchini,C., Norton,J., Capobianco,A.J., and Bresnick,E.H. (2000). Suppression of erythroid but not megakaryocytic differentiation of human K562 erythroleukemic cells by Notch-1. *J. Biol. Chem.* *275*, 19676-19684.
- Li,L., Milner,L.A., Deng,Y., Iwata,M., Banta,A., Graf,L., Marcovina,S., Friedman,C., Trask,B.J., Hood,L., and Torok-Storb,B. (1998). The human homolog of Rat *Jagged1* expressed by bone marrow stroma inhibits differentiation of 32D cells through interaction with Notch1. *Immunity* *8*, 43-55.
- Milner,L.A. and Bigas,A. (1999). Notch as a mediator of cell fate determination in hematopoiesis: evidence and speculation. *Blood* *93*, 2431-2448.
- Nakano,T., Kodama,H., and Honjo,T. (1994). Generation of lymphohematopoietic cells from embryonic stem cells in culture. *Science* *265*, 1098-1101.
- Ohishi,K., Varnum-Finney,B., Flowers,D., Anasetti,C., Myerson,D., and Bernstein,I.D. (2000). Monocytes express high amounts of Notch and undergo cytokine specific apoptosis following interaction with the Notch ligand, Delta-1. *Blood* *95*, 2847-2854.
- Pui,J.C., Allman,D., Xu,L., DeRocco,S., Karnell,F.G., Bakkour,S., Lee,J.Y., Kadesch,T., Hardy,R.R., Aster,J.C., and Pear,W.S. (1999). Notch1 expression in early lymphopoiesis influences B versus T lineage determination. *Immunity* *11*, 299-308.
- Radtke,F., Wilson,A., Stark,G., Bauer,M., van Meerwijk,J., MacDonald,H.R., and Aguet,M. (1999). Deficient T cell fate specification in mice with an induced inactivation of *Notch1*. *Immunity* *10*, 547-558.
- Robey,E., Chang,D., Itano,A., Cado,D., Alexander,H., Lans,D., Weinmaster,G., and Salmon,P. (1996). An activated form of Notch influences the choice between CD4 and CD8 T cell lineages. *Cell* *87*, 483-492.

Rothenberg,E.V. (2000). Stepwise specification of lymphocyte developmental lineages. *Curr. Opin. Genet. Dev.* 10, 370-379.

Schmitt,T.M. and Zúñiga-Pflücker,J.C. (2002). Induction of T cell development from hematopoietic progenitor cells by Delta-like-1 in vitro. *Immunity.* 17, 749-756.

Shelly,L.L., Fuchs,C., and Miele,L. (2000). Notch-1 inhibits apoptosis in murine erythroleukemia cells and is necessary for differentiation induced by hybrid polar compounds. *J. Cell. Biochem.* 73, 164-175.

Staal,F.J.T., Weerkamp,F., Langerak,A.W., Hendriks,R.W., and Clevers,H.C. (2001). Transcriptional control of T lymphocyte differentiation. *Stem Cells* 19, 165-179.

Tan-Pertel,H.T., Walker,L., Browning,D., Miyamoto,A., Weinmaster,G., and Gasson,J.C. (2000). Notch signaling enhances survival and alters differentiation of 32D myeloblasts. *J. Immunol.* 165, 4428-4436.

van Ewijk,W., Wang,B., Hollander,G., Kawamoto,H., Spanopoulou,E., Itoi,M., Amagai,T., Jiang,Y.F., Germeraad,W.T., Chen,W.F., and Katsura,Y. (1999). Thymic microenvironments, 3-D versus 2-D? *Semin. Immunol.* 11, 57-64.

Varnum-Finney,B., Xu,L., Brashem-Stein,C., Nourigat,C., Flowers,D., Bakkour,S., Pear,W.S., and Bernstein,I.D. (2000). Pluripotent, cytokine-dependent, hematopoietic stem cells are immortalized by constitutive Notch1 signaling. *Nature Medicine* 6, 1278-1281.

Wolfer,A., Bakker,T., Wilson,A., Nicolas,M., Ioannidis,V., Littman,D.R., Lee,P.P., Wilson,C.B., Held,W., MacDonald,H.R., and Radtke,F. (2001). Inactivation of Notch 1 in immature thymocytes does not perturb CD4 or CD8 T cell development. *Nat. Immunol.* 2, 235-241.